



FINAL SCOPING REPORT

PROPOSED N2 WILD COAST

TOLL HIGHWAY

Volume 1: Main Report

Prepared for:

National Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism,
Eastern Cape Department of Economic Affairs, Environment and Tourism, and
KwaZulu-Natal Department of Agriculture and Environmental Affairs

Prepared by:

CCA Environmental (Pty) Ltd

On behalf of:

The South African National Roads Agency Limited

Contact:

CCA Environmental (Pty) Ltd
Unit 35 Roeland Square
30 Drury Lane
Cape Town
8001
Tel: (021) 461 1118
Fax: (021) 461 1120
Email: fuad@ccaenvironmental.co.za



TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
TABLE OF CONTENTS	xli
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1-1
1.1 Background	1-1
1.1.1 The N2 Wild Coast Consortium Unsolicited Proposal	1-1
1.1.2 Previous EIA	1-1
1.2 Terms of Reference for the current EIA	1-2
1.3 <u>Structure of the FSR</u>	1-3
1.4 <u>Way Forward in concluding the Scoping Study</u>	1-4
CHAPTER 2 STUDY APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY	2-1
2.1 EIA Legislative context and guiding principles	2-1
2.1.1 The Environment Conservation Act, as amended	2-1
2.1.2 National Environmental Management Act	2-2
2.1.3 National Heritage Resources Act	2-2
2.2 Scoping Study Approach	2-2
2.2.1 General	2-2
2.2.2 Objectives of the Scoping Study	2-3
2.3 Scoping Process Tasks	2-4
2.4 Public Consultation in the Scoping Study	2-5
2.5 Assumptions and Limitations	2-6
2.6 Way Forward	2-7
2.6.1 <u>Consideration and acceptance of the FSR</u>	2-7
2.6.2 Impact Assessment Phase	2-7
2.6.2.1 Specialist Studies	2-7
2.6.2.2 Integration and Assessment	2-8
2.6.3 Environmental Management Plan	2-9
CHAPTER 3 GENERAL PROJECT INFORMATION	3-1
3.1 Legislative Framework for Tolling of National Roads	3-1
3.1.1 South African National Roads Agency and the National Roads Act, 1998 (Act No. 7 of 1998)	3-1
3.1.2 Unsolicited Proposal Process	3-2
3.1.2.1 Scheme Development	3-2
3.1.2.2 Tender Process	3-2
3.1.2.3 Notice of Intent for declaration of a Toll Road	3-4
3.1.2.4 Process leading to Financial Closure	3-4
3.2 Rationale for tolling at a national level	3-4
3.2.1 Fuel Levy Allocation	3-4
3.2.2 Budget Constraints	3-4
3.2.3 Road Maintenance Costs	3-5
3.3 Motivation for the Proposed N2 Wild Coast Toll Highway	3-6
3.3.1 National and Regional Economic Context	3-6
3.3.2 Summary of Key Problems along the existing N2 and R61 sections of the Proposed N2 Wild Coast Toll Highway and potential benefits to the road user	3-7
3.3.3 Current and Predicted Future Traffic Volumes	3-9
3.3.3.1 Traffic volumes on the proposed N2 Wild Coast Toll Highway	3-9
3.3.3.2 Traffic volumes on the N2 section between Adams Road and Isipingo Interchanges	3-10
3.4 Toll Plaza layout and operation	3-10
3.5 Toll Sections and toll tariffs	3-11
3.5.1 General overview	3-11

3.5.2	Toll sections of the proposed N2 Wild Coast Toll Highway	3-12
3.6	Operation and maintenance	3-13
3.6.1	Toll collection, plaza and equipment maintenance	3-13
3.6.2	Route operations, safety, traffic management and overloading control	3-13
3.6.3	Road maintenance	3-14
3.7	Empowerment strategy	3-14
CHAPTER 4	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	4-1
4.1	Broad description of proposed project	4-1
4.2	Description of initial construction works	4-3
4.2.1	Section 1: Gonubie Interchange to Ngobozi	4-3
4.2.2	Section 2: Ngobozi to Mthatha (Ngqeleni)	4-4
4.2.3	Section 3: Mthatha (Ngqeleni) to Ndwalane	4-6
4.2.4	Section 4: Ndwalane to Ntafufu River	4-8
4.2.5	Section 5: Ntafufu River to Lusikisiki (Magwa Intersection)	4-9
4.2.6	Section 6: Lusikisiki (Magwa Intersection) to Mthamvuna River	4-9
4.2.7	Section 7: Mthamvuna River to Isipingo Interchange	4-11
4.3	Work to be undertaken during balance of the concession period	4-13
4.4	General improvements	4-13
CHAPTER 5	CONSIDERATION OF ALTERNATIVES	5-1
5.1	The “Do Nothing” Alternative	5-1
5.2	Alternative route alignments	5-2
5.2.1	Upgrade of existing N2 or R61	5-3
5.2.2	Alternative Greenfields Routes between Lusikisiki and the Mthamvuna River	5-6
5.2.3	Route immediately north-west of the Msikaba Sandstone Formation	5-8
5.2.4	Localised alternative route alignments	5-9
5.2.4.1	Upgrade existing R61 between Ndwalane and Ntafufu River via the Pondoland Bridge	5-9
5.2.4.2	Site-specific alternative route alignments	5-10
5.2.5	Additional alternative routes considered after distribution of the DSR	5-11
5.2.5.1	Gallagher route	5-11
5.2.5.2	WESSA and Coastal Mzamba routes	5-13
5.3	Alternative Toll Plaza locations	5-16
5.4	Overall summary	5-16
CHAPTER 6	THE AFFECTED ENVIRONMENT	6-1
6.1	Study area	6-1
6.2	Biophysical Environment	6-1
6.2.1	Climate	6-1
6.2.2	Topography and geology	6-2
6.2.3	Aquatic environment	6-3
6.2.4	Vegetation	6-4
6.2.5	Terrestrial fauna	6-6
6.2.6	Biodiversity conservation	6-7
6.3	Socio-Economic Environment	6-9
6.3.1	Provincial context	6-9
6.3.2	Municipal context	6-9
6.3.3	Tourism overview	6-12
6.3.4	Social and land use aspects	6-13
6.4	Cultural and Historical Heritage	6-14
6.5	Planning Considerations	6-15
6.5.1	Eastern Cape	6-15
6.5.2	KwaZulu-Natal	6-22
6.6	Legal considerations	6-23
6.6.1	General Legislation	6-23
6.6.2	Legislation relevant to the Construction and/or Operation Phase of the project	6-24

CHAPTER 7 ISSUES AND CONCERNS	7-1
7.1 Introduction	7-1
7.2 Summary of issues and concerns raised during previous EIA process	7-1
7.2.1 Social Issues	7-2
7.2.2 Economic Issues	7-2
7.2.3 EIA process and Legal Issues	7-4
7.2.4 Alternative Routes	7-5
7.2.5 Tolling Issues	7-6
7.2.6 Specialist Studies Issues	7-7
7.2.7 Public Consultation Process	7-9
7.2.8 Scope of Work and Construction Issues	7-10
7.2.9 Biophysical Issues	7-12
7.2.10 Road, Traffic and Transport Issues	7-13
7.2.11 Planning and Policy Issues	7-14
7.2.12 Motivation/Need for the Project	7-15
7.3 Key Shortcomings and/or Gaps to be addressed in this EIA Process	7-17
7.4 Summary of Issues and Concerns raised on the Current EIA Process	7-17
7.4.1 Role of SANRAL and N2 Wild Coast Consortium	7-18
7.4.2 Plan of Study for Scoping	7-18
7.4.3 Declaration to Toll Process and assessment of tolling impacts in the EIA	7-18
7.4.4 Information in Background Information Document	7-18
7.4.5 EIA Timeframes	7-18
7.4.6 Choice of main consultants	7-19
7.4.7 Independence of consultants	7-19
7.4.8 Public Consultation Process	7-19
7.4.9 EIA Process	7-20
7.4.10 Use of information from the previous EIA	7-21
7.4.11 Assessment of alternatives	7-21
7.4.12 Provision of information in the EIA	7-22
7.4.13 Project description	7-22
7.4.14 Validity of information from the previous study	7-22
7.4.15 EIA Regulations	7-22
7.4.16 Motivation for the project	7-22
7.4.17 Scope of issues to be assessed in EIA	7-22
7.4.18 Specialist consultants	7-23
7.4.19 Validity of curtailed Scoping process	7-23
7.4.20 Lack of SEA	7-23
7.5 Summary of Issues and Concerns raised during comment period on DSR	7-23
7.5.1 EIA Process and legal aspects	7-24
7.5.2 Public Consultation Process	7-36
7.5.3 Specialist Studies issues	7-43
7.5.4 Planning and Policy issues	7-48
7.5.5 Motivation/Need for the project	7-51
7.5.6 Scope of work and construction issues	7-54
7.5.7 Road, traffic and transportation issues	7-60
7.5.8 Alternative routes	7-64
7.5.9 Tolling issues	7-66
7.5.10 Economic issues	7-75
7.5.11 Social issues	7-82
7.5.12 Biophysical issues	7-85
7.6 Key Issues and Concerns raised	7-87
7.6.1 Legality and adequacy of the EIA Process	7-87
7.6.2 Validity of the use of information from the previous EIA Process	7-88
7.6.3 Adequacy of the consideration of alternatives	7-89
7.6.4 Adequacy of the consideration of alternative alignments	7-90
7.6.5 Adequacy of the Public Consultation Process	7-90
7.6.6 Adequacy of the motivation/need for the proposed project	7-94
7.6.7 Potential biophysical, social and economic impacts of the proposed project	7-95
7.6.8 General support for the proposed project in the Eastern Cape and general opposition to the proposed project in KwaZulu-Natal	7-95
7.6.9 Reliance on information provided by SANRAL	7-95
7.6.10 Cross-subsidisation	7-96
7.6.11 Bypasses to Butterworth, Dutywa and Mthatha	7-97

CHAPTER 8	POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS	8-1
8.1	Biophysical Impacts	8-1
	8.1.1 Vegetation	8-1
	8.1.2 Fauna	8-2
	8.1.3 Aquatic systems	8-2
	8.1.4 Soils, land use and agriculture	8-3
8.2	Social Impacts	8-3
	8.2.1 Social structures, functions and processes	8-3
	8.2.2 Tourism	8-3
	8.2.3 Cultural and historical heritage	8-4
	8.2.4 Noise	8-4
	8.2.5 Air quality	8-4
	8.2.6 Visual	8-5
	8.2.7 Traffic	8-5
	8.2.8 Planning / development aspects	8-5
8.3	Economic Impacts	8-6
CHAPTER 9	PROPOSED TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR SPECIALIST STUDIES	9-1
9.1	General Introduction	9-1
9.2	General Terms of Reference for specialist studies	9-1
9.3	Specific Terms of Reference for specialist studies	9-2
	9.3.1 Vegetation and flora	9-2
	9.3.2 Fauna	9-3
	9.3.3 Aquatic ecosystems	9-3
	9.3.4 Soils, land use and agriculture	9-3
	9.3.5 Social study	9-3
	9.3.6 Tourism	9-4
	9.3.7 Cultural and historical heritage	9-4
	9.3.8 Noise	9-4
	9.3.9 Air quality	9-5
	9.3.10 Visual	9-5
	9.3.11 Traffic	9-5
	9.3.12 Planning / development	9-5
	9.3.13 Economic	9-6
9.4	Proposed Impact Rating Methodology	9-6
CHAPTER 10	CONCLUSIONS AND WAY FORWARD	10-1
10.1	Conclusions	10-1
	10.1.1 Issues and Concerns	10-1
	10.1.1.1 Previous EIA process	10-1
	10.1.1.2 Key shortcomings and/or gaps to be addressed in the current EIA process	10-3
	10.1.1.3 Current EIA process	10-3
	10.1.1.4 Issues and concerns raised during comment period on the DSR	10-4
	10.1.1.5 Key issues and concerns raised	10-5
	10.1.2 Alternatives	10-12
	10.1.2.1 Alternative alignments considered initially	10-12
	10.1.2.2 Additional alternative routes considered after distribution of the DSR	10-14
	10.1.2.3 Overall summary	10-15
	10.1.3 Proposed Specialist Studies	10-16
10.2	Way Forward	10-17

REFERENCES

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	The proposed N2 Wild Coast Toll Highway route between the Gonubie Interchange (Eastern Cape) and the Isipingo Interchange (KwaZulu-Natal)	1-5
Figure 2.1	Public consultation in the Scoping Study phase	2-10
Figure 2.2	Way forward in the EIA process	2-11
Figure 3.1	Flowchart of the Unsolicited Proposal Process	3-3
Figure 3.2	Road conditions over time and increased costs associated with inadequate road maintenance (after SANRAL, 2002)	3-6
Figure 4.1	Section 1 – Gonubie Interchange to Ngobozi	4-14
Figure 4.2	Section 2 – Ngobozi to Mthatha (Ngqeleni)	4-15
Figure 4.3	Section 3 – Mthatha (Ngqeleni) to Ndwalane	4-16
Figure 4.4	Section 4 – Ndwalane to Ntafufu River	4-17
Figure 4.5	Section 5 – Ntafufu River to Lusikisiki (Magwa Intersection)	4-18
Figure 4.6	Section 6 – Lusikisiki (Magwa Intersection) to Mthamvuna River	4-19
Figure 4.7	Section 7 – Mthamvuna River to Isipingo Interchange	4-20
Figure 4.8	Detailed Section – Pennington to Durban	4-21
Figure 5.1	Alternative greenfields routes between Lusikisiki and the Mthamvuna River	5-17
Figure 5.2	“Quantm Pathfinder” alignment of route immediately north-west of Msikaba Sandstone Formation	5-18
Figure 5.3	Additional alternative alignments analysed after distribution of the DSR	5-19
Figure 5.4	“Quantm Pathfinder” alignment of the section of the Gallagher route across the Mzimvubu River	5-20
Figure 5.5	Proposed routes between Mthatha and Port Shepstone showing ecological sensitivity, boundaries of the Pondoland Centre of Endemism and the Wild Coast National Park planning domain	5-21
Figure 5.6	“Quantm Pathfinder” alignment of WESSA route between Lusikisiki and the Mthamvuna River	5-22
Figure 5.7	“Quantm Pathfinder” alignment of the Coastal Mzamba route between the Mthentu River and the Mthamvuna River	5-23
Figure 5.8	Proposed routes between Lusikisiki and the Mthamvuna River showing sensitivity, boundaries of the Pondoland Centre of Endemism and the Wild Coast National Park planning domain	5-24
Figure 6.1	Satellite image of topography in the study area between Lusikisiki and the Mthamvuna River, with SANRAL’s preferred greenfields route through this section	6-29
Figure 6.2	Vegetation types in the study area between Mthatha and Port Shepstone (Mucina & Rutherford in press)	6-30
Figure 6.3	The Pondoland Biosphere Priority Area and Mthamvuna Expansion Priority Area showing priority forest, coastal, river and estuarine areas within. Biomes, existing protected areas and the proposed Pondoland Biosphere Reserve are also shown (from Reyers & Ginsburg, 2005)	6-31
Figure 6.4	Proposed Pondoland/Wild Coast National Park planning domain (source: SANParks)	6-32

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	Current problems along the existing N2 and R61 sections of the proposed toll highway and potential benefits of the proposed project to the road user	3-8
Table 3.2	Current and predicted future daily traffic flows on the N2 and R61	3-10
Table 3.3	Toll road tariffs (Rand) across South Africa (after SANRAL, 2006)	3-11
Table 3.4	Toll sections and associated mainline toll plazas	3-13
Table 4.1	Proposed construction activities per road section between the Gonubie Interchange and Ngobozi	4-4
Table 4.2	Proposed construction activities per road section between Ngobozi and Mthatha (Ngqeleni)	4-5
Table 4.3	Proposed construction activities per road section between Mthatha (Ngqeleni) and Ndwalane	4-7
Table 4.4	Proposed construction activities for the road section between Ndwalane and Ntafufu River	4-8

Table 4.5	Proposed construction activities for the road section between the Ntafufu River and Lusikisiki (Magwa Intersection)	4-9
Table 4.6	Proposed construction activities per road section between the Lusikisiki (Magwa Intersection) and the Mthamvuna River	4-10
Table 4.7	Proposed construction activities per road section between the Mthamvuna River and the Isipingo Interchange	4-11
Table 5.1	Comparison of the environmental, technical, financial and economic implications of the proposed toll highway versus upgrading of the existing N2 or R61 between Mthatha and Port Shepstone in relation to the “do nothing” alternative	5-4
Table 5.2	Comparative distances and estimated travel times between some locations on the Wild Coast along various existing routes versus the proposed toll highway	5-5
Table 5.3	Comparison of the environmental, technical, financial and economic implications of alternative greenfields alignments between Lusikisiki and the Mthamvuna River	5-7
Table 5.4	<u>Comparison of the environmental, technical, financial and economic implications of the proposed toll highway and Gallagher route between Mthatha and Port Shepstone in relation to the “do nothing” alternative</u>	<u>5-12</u>
Table 5.5	<u>Comparison of the environmental, technical and financial implications of additional alternative greenfields alignments between Lusikisiki and the Mthamvuna River</u>	<u>5-14</u>
Table 6.1	Climate data for road sections along the proposed route (Weather Bureau, 1997)	6-1
Table 6.2	Total land cover and protected area coverage of the Wild Coast (adapted from Reyers & Ginsburg, 2005)	6-8
Table 7.1	Summary of issues and concerns relating to social aspects	7-2
Table 7.2	Summary of issues and concerns relating to economic aspects	7-2
Table 7.3	Summary of issues and concerns relating to the previous EIA process and legal aspects	7-4
Table 7.4	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Alternative routes	7-5
Table 7.5	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Tolling	7-6
Table 7.6	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Specialist Studies	7-7
Table 7.7	Summary of issues and concerns relating to the previous Public Consultation Process	7-9
Table 7.8	Summary of issues and concerns relating to the Scope of Work and Construction	7-10
Table 7.9	Summary of issues and concerns relating to the Biophysical environment	7-12
Table 7.10	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Road, Traffic and Transport aspects	7-13
Table 7.11	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Planning and Policy	7-14
Table 7.12	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Motivation/Need for the Project	7-16
Table 7.13	Summary of issues and concerns relating to EIA process and legal aspects	7-24
Table 7.14	Summary of issues and concerns relating to the Public Consultation process	7-36
Table 7.15	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Specialist Studies	7-43
Table 7.16	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Planning and Policy	7-48
Table 7.17	Summary of issues and concerns relating to the Motivation/Need for the project	7-51
Table 7.18	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Scope of work and construction aspects	7-54
Table 7.19	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Road, traffic and transportation	7-60
Table 7.20	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Alternative routes	7-64
Table 7.21	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Tolling	7-66
Table 7.22	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Economic aspects	7-75
Table 7.23	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Social aspects	7-82
Table 7.24	Summary of issues and concerns relating to Biophysical aspects	7-85
Table 9.1	Impact assessment criteria and rating scales	9-6
Table 9.2	Convention for assigning significance ratings	9-7

LIST OF APPENDICES

Volume 1

Appendix 1	SANRAL Unsolicited Proposal Policy
Appendix 2	Plan of Study for Scoping
Appendix 3	Issues Trail of previous EIA process and Appeals period
Appendix 4	Plates

Volume 2, Part 1

Appendix 5	List of Interested and Affected Parties
	- Eastern Cape
	- KwaZulu-Natal

	- Other
Appendix 6	Notification and Background Information Document
Appendix 7	Copies of Advertisements
Appendix 8	Specialist Screening Study Input
	- Vegetation and flora
	- Social
	- Financial and economic
Appendix 9	Comments and Responses Report on the Background Information Document including:
	- Addendum A: Copies of written comments received on the EIA process within the comment period
	- Addendum B: Copies of written comments received on the proposed project within the comment period
	- Addendum C: Copies of written comments received outside the comment period
Appendix 10	Public Consultation Process Report (Nomi Muthialu & Associates)
Appendix 11	<u>Draft Scoping Report Notification Letter and Executive Summary</u>
Appendix 12	<u>Copies of Advertisements on Draft Scoping Report</u>
Appendix 13	<u>Minutes of Meetings</u>

Volume 2, Part 2

Appendix 14	<u>Comments and Responses Report on Draft Scoping Report including Copies of Written Comments received</u>
-------------	--

Volume2, Part 3

Appendix 15	<u>Minutes of Workshops on Additional Alignments</u>
Appendix 16	<u>Specialist Addenda Reports on Additional Alignments</u>
Appendix 17	<u>Independent Technical Review of SANRAL Information</u>
Appendix 18	<u>Typical layout details of proposed road construction and/or upgrades</u>

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ABET	Adult Basic Education and Training
ADT	Average Daily Traffic
BAFOs	Best and Final Offers
BAP	Biodiversity Action Plan
B:C	Benefit:Cost Ratio
BID	Background Information Document
BOT	Build-Operate-Transfer
BSAP	Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan
CBD	Central Business District
CCA	CCA Environmental (Pty) Ltd
CPI	Consumer Price Index
DAEA	KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Department of Agriculture and Environmental Affairs
DBSA	Development Bank of Southern Africa
DEAET	Eastern Cape Provincial Department of Economic Affairs, Environment and Tourism
DEAT	Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism
DM	District Municipality
DME	Department of Minerals and Energy Affairs
DSR	Draft Scoping Report
EC	Eastern Cape
ECA	Environment Conservation Act (Act No. 73 of 1989), as amended
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EIR	Environmental Impact Report
EMP	Environmental Management Plan
FSR	Final Scoping Report
GCS	Groundwater Consulting Services
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GGP	Gross Geographic Product
HDI	Historically Disadvantaged Individual
I&AP	Interested and Affected Party
IDP	Integrated Development Plan

IEM	Integrated Environmental Management
IRR	Internal Rate of Return
IUCN	World Conservation Union
KZN	KwaZulu-Natal
LM	Local Municipality
LOS	Level of Service
MPRDA	Minerals and Petroleum Resources Development Act (Act No. 28 of 2002)
MRC	Mineral Resource Commodities
N2WCC	N2 Wild Coast Consortium
NEMA	National Environmental Management Act (Act No. 107 of 1998), as amended
NHRA	National Heritage Resources Act
NMA	Nomi Muthialu & Associates (Pty) Ltd
NPV	Net Present Value
PCE	Pondoland Centre of Endemism
PV	Present Value
RoD	Record of Decision
SA RDB	South African Red Data Book
SAHRA	South African Heritage Resources Agency
SANRAL	South African National Roads Agency Limited
SAPS	South African Police Services
SDI	Spatial Development Initiative
SDF	Spatial Development Framework
SEA	Strategic Environmental Assessment
SED	Socio-Economic Development
SMMEs	Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises
TEM	TransWorld Energy and Mineral Resources (S.A.) Pty Ltd
UDM	Ugu District Municipality
UNDP-GEF	United Nations Development Programme's Global Environment Facility
VOC	Vehicle Operating Cost
WCSDF	Wild Coast Spatial Development Framework